

**Pribadi dalam Komunitas sebagai Model Relasi Manusia dan Masyarakat
dalam Gagasan “*embedded economy*” Karl Polanyi**

Tesis untuk memenuhi sebagian persyaratan mencapai derajat Magister
Program Studi Magister Ilmu Filsafat

Diajukan oleh

Yustinus Prastowo

01060806/20063301010860011

Kepada

PROGRAM PASCASARJANA

SEKOLAH TINGGI FILSAFAT DRIYARKARA

Jakarta, April 2011

TESIS

**PRIBADI DALAM KOMUNITAS SEBAGAI MODEL RELASI MANUSIA DAN
MASYARAKAT DALAM GAGASAN "EMBEDDED ECONOMY" KARL POLANYI**

Yang dipersiapkan dan disusun oleh

Yustinus Prastowo

01060806/20063301010860011

telah dipertahankan di depan Panitia Pengaji

pada tanggal 27 April 2011 dan dinyatakan telah lulus memenuhi syarat

PANITIA UJIAN

Ketua Panitia Ujian/Pengaji I



Dr. B. Herry-Priyono

Pengaji II



Prof. Dr. J. Sudarminta

Pengaji III



Dr. JB. Hari Kustanto

Disahkan pada tanggal

2011

Direktur Program Pascasarjana
Sekolah Tinggi Filsafat Driyarkara

Prof. Dr. J. Sudarminta

Ketua
Sekolah Tinggi Filsafat Driyarkara

Dr. Shmon P. Lili Tjahjadi



ABSTRAK

- [A] Nama : Yustinus Prastowo (01060806/20063301010860011)
- [B] Judul Tesis : Pribadi dalam Komunitas sebagai Model Relasi Manusia dan Masyarakat dalam Gagasan "*embedded economy*" Karl Polanyi
- [C] vi + 131 halaman; 2011
- [D] Kata- kunci : Sistem Pasar Swatata, Kapitalisme, Ketimbabalikan, Redistribusi, *Embeddedness*, *Disembeddedness*, Komoditas Semu, Gerakan ganda, Gerakan tandingan, Kesesatan Ekonomistik, Ekonomi Formal, Ekonomi Substantif, Ekonomi sebagai Proses Kelembagaan, Rasionalitas Atomik, Pribadi dalam Komunitas, Rasionalitas Organik, Masyarakat Kompleks.
- [E] Isi Abstrak: Tujuan dari penulisan tesis ini adalah belajar dari pemikiran Karl Polanyi tentang sistem pasar swatata (*self-regulating market system*). Sistem pasar swatata adalah sistem yang dipandu dan digerakkan oleh harga saja. Ini menunjukkan ciri mengacu diri sendiri (*self-referential*), dan bukan mengacu pada institusi di luar ekonomi (*other-referential*). Untuk mewujudkan proyek normatifnya, sistem pasar swatata melakukan komodifikasi atas tenaga kerja, tanah, dan uang (*modal*). Implikasinya adalah kehancuran masyarakat. Untuk mencegahnya, masyarakat melakukan perlindungan diri. Polanyi menyebutnya gerakan ganda (*double movement*). Terhadap sistem pasar swatata ditunjukkan terjadinya kesesatan ekonomistik yang bersandar pada makna formal ekonomi, yaitu kalkulasi pengejaran kepentingan diri yang bersandar pada dua motif, pengejaran keuntungan dan ketakutan akan kelaparan. Sebaliknya Polanyi menunjukkan makna substantif ekonomi yang berlaku universal, yaitu pemenuhan kebutuhan hidup dalam relasinya dengan sesama dan lingkungannya. Secara historis, eksistensi sistem pasar tidak pernah dominan dan ada bersamaan dengan model integrasi lain, ketimbabalikan dan redistribusi yang disangga kesejarahan dan keterpusatan. Polanyi mengajukan konsep *embeddedness* sebagai hakikat ontologis, bahwa ekonomi selalu terjalin dengan institusi nonekonomi. Dan secara epistemologis ekonomi dipahami sebagai proses kelembagaan. Akhirnya ditunjukkan konsep rasionalitas organik sebagai model relasi manusia dan masyarakat yang kooperatif dan koordinatif, berlawanan dengan rasionalitas atomik yang menjadi corak sistem pasar swatata.
- [F] Daftar Pustaka : 105 (1935-2010)
- [G] Dosen Pembimbing : Dr. B. Herry-Priyono.

Daftar Isi

Bab I Pendahuluan	1
1.1. Latar Belakang	1
1.2. Permasalahan (Problematika)	8
1.3. Pertanyaan Tesis	9
1.4. Metodologi	10
1.5. Sistematika Tesis	10
Bab II Karl Polanyi dan Sistem Pasar Swatata	12
2.1. Tentang Karl Polanyi	12
2.2. Karya Karl Polanyi	13
2.3. Seratus Tahun yang Damai	16
2.4. Prinsip Dasar Sistem Pasar Swatata	18
2.5. Rangkuman	27
Bab III Letak Ekonomi dalam Masyarakat	30
3.1. Pengantar	30
3.2. Makna Formal dan Makna Substantif	30
3.3. Kesesatan Ekonomistik	39
3.4. Ekonomi sebagai Proses Terlembaga.....	44
3.5. Model Integrasi : Rumah tangga, Ketimbabalikan, Redistribusi, dan Pasar	48
3.6. Komoditas Semu	56
3.7. Rangkuman	63
Bab IV Gerakan Ganda dalam Pemikiran Polanyi	65
4.1. Pengantar	65
4.2. Gerakan Ganda dan Kerusakan Sistem	66
4.3. Proteksionisme Sosial: Kontra-Pengimban atau Patologi Pasar	71
4.4. Fungsionalisme Karl Polanyi?	71
4.5. Makna Gerakan ganda dan Perspektif Lingkup Kemasyarakatan	74
4.6. Rangkuman	74

Bab V Konsep ‘embeddedness’ dalam Pemikiran Karl Polanyi	76
5.1. Pengantar	76
5.2. Karir Konsep ‘Embeddedness’	76
5.3. Dualitas ‘embeddedness’ dalam Karya Karl Polanyi	80
5.4. Kembali ke Pengertian Dasar <i>Embeddedness</i>	91
5.5. <i>Embeddedness</i> dan Ekonomi sebagai Proses Terlembaga.....	97
5.6. Rangkuman	101
Bab VI Pribadi dalam Komunitas sebagai Model Relasi Manusia dan Masyarakat ..	103
6.1. Pengantar	103
6.2. <i>Embedded Economy</i> Menurut Polanyi	103
6.3. Konstruksi Manusia dalam Pemikiran Polanyi	104
6.4. Realitas Masyarakat dan Masyarakat Kompleks	108
6.5. Pribadi dalam Komunitas sebagai model Relasi Manusia dan Masyarakat	119
Bab VII Penutup	128
7.1. Kesimpulan	128
7.2. Catatan Kritis dan Relevansi	132
Daftar Pustaka	135

Daftar Pustaka

Kepustakaan Primer:

Polanyi, Karl, John Lewis, and Donald K. Kitchin,eds., *Christianity and the Social Revolution*, New York,1936

Polanyi, Karl, *The Great Transformation: The Political and Economic Origins of Our Times*, Beacon Press,2001 (asli,1944)

Polanyi,Karl, Conrad Arensberg, and Harry Pearson, eds., *Trade and Market in The Early Empires*, Glencoe,IL:Free Press,1957

Polanyi, Karl (G.Dalton, ed.), *Primitive Archaic and Modern Economies: Essay of Karl Polanyi*. Anchor,1968

Polanyi, Karl, *Dahomey and the Slave Trade*, The University of Washington Press, USA, 1966

Polanyi, Karl, *Livehood of Man*, (ed. Harry W. Pearson), Academic Press, New York, 1977

Kepustakaan Sekunder:

Adaman, Fikret and Yahya M. Madra, 'Theorizing the 'Third Sphere': a Critique of the Persistence of the 'Economistic Fallacy'', *Journal of Economic Issue*, Vol. 36 No.4 , 2002

Adams, John, 'Economy as Instituted Process: Change, Transformation, and Progress', *Journal of Economic Issues*, Vol. XXVIII No. 2, 1994

Ankarloo, Daniel, 'Using Karl Polanyi as a stepping stone for a critique of the new institutional orthodoxy, paper presented at the CRIC Workshp:"Polanyian Perspectives on Instituted Economic Process: Development and Transformation", The University of Manchester, U.K., 23-25 October 2002

Arrighi, Giovanni, 'The Social and Political Economy of Global Turbulence', *New Left Review*, No.20, Mar-Apr 2003, hlm. 4-71.

Bair, Jennifer, 'Analysing economic organization: embedded networks and global chains compared', *Economy and Society*, Vol. 37, 2008:339-364.

Barber, Bernard, 'All Economies Are "Embedded": The Career of a Concept, and Beyond', *Social Research*, Vol. 62, No. 2, 1995, hlm.

Baum, Gregory, *Karl Polanyi on Ethics and Economics*, McGill-Queen's University Press, Montreal, 1996.

Becker, Gary, *The Economic Approach to Human Behavior*, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1976

Beckert, Jens, 'Interpenetration versus Embeddedness: The Premature Dismissal of Talcott Parsons in the New Economic Sociology', *The American Journal of Economics and Sociology*, Vol. 65, issue 1, 2006.

Berger, Sebastian, 'Karl Polanyi's and Karl William Kapp's Substantive Economics: Important Insights from the Kapp-Polanyi Correspondence', *Review of Social Economy*, Vol. 66, 2008, 381-396.

Berthoud, Gerald, "Toward a Comparative Approach: The Contribution of Karl Polanyi", dalam *The Life and Work of Karl Polanyi*, (ed. Kari-Polanyi Levitt), Black Rose Books:1990.

Birchfield, Vicky, 'Contesting the Hegemony of Market Ideology: Gramsci's 'Good Sense' and Polanyi's 'Double Movement'', *Review of International Political Economy*, Vol. 6, No.1, 1999, hlm.27-54

Block, Fred and Margaretha Sommers, 'In the Shadow of Speenhamland', *Politics and Society*, Vol.31, No.2, June 2003, 1-41.

Block, Fred, 'Contradiction of Capitalism as a World System', *Critical Sociology* 25,2/3, 1999

Block, Fred, 'Karl Polanyi and the writing of The Great Transformation', *Theory and Society*, Vol. 32,2003, hlm. 275-306.

Block, Fred, 'Understanding the Diverging Trajectories of the United States and Western Europe: A Neo-Polanyian Analysis', *Politics & Society*, Vol.35 No.1, March 2007

Blyth, Mark, *Great Transformations Economic Ideas and Institutional Change in the Twentieth Century*, Cambridge University Press, USA, 2002.

Blyth, Mark, 'The great transformation in understanding Polanyi: reply to Hejeebu and McCloskey', *Critical Review*, 16:1, 117-133.

Boltanski, Luc and Eve Chiapello, *The New Spirit of Capitalism*, Verso, 2007 [2005].

Brenner, Robert, *The Economics of Global Turbulence*, Verso, 2006

Browne, Katherine E. dan B. Lynne Milgram (eds.), *Economics and Morality Anthropological Approach*, Altamira Press, UK, 2009

Bryant, C.G.A and E. Mokrzycki, "Introduction. Theorizing the Changes in East-Central Europe." P.1-3 in *The New Great Transformation? Change and Continuity in East-Central Europe*, edited by C.G.A. Bryant and E. Mokrzycki, London, Routledge, 1994

Bugra, Asye and Kaan Agartan, *Reading Karl Polanyi for the Twenty-First Century Market Economy as a Political Project*, Palgrave Macmillan, NY, 2007.

Burawoy, Michael, 'For a Sociological Marxism: The Complementary Convergence of Antonio Gramsci and Karl Polanyi', *Politics and Society*, Vol.31, No.2, June 2003:193-261

Caldararo, Niccolo, "Primitive and Modern Economics: Derivatives, Liquidity, Value, Panic and Crises, A Uniformitarian View", *Socio Economy*, 2008, Vol. 38, hlm. 31-51.

Cassidy, John, "Letter From Chicago: After The Blowup", *The New Yorker*, Januari 11,2010, hlm.1-6.

Clark, Charles M.A., 'Spontaneous Order versus Instituted Process: The Market as Cause and Effect', *Journal of Economic Issues*, Vol. 27, No.2, 1993

Dale, Gareth, 'Karl Polanyi in Budapest: On his Political and Intellectual Formation', *Arch Europe Sociology*, 2009, p.97-130.

Dale, Gareth, *Karl Polanyi The Limit of Market*, Polity Press, London, 2010a.

Dale, Gareth, 'Karl Polanyi's The Great Transformation: perverse effects, protectionism and Gemeinschaft', *Economy and Society*, Vol. 37 No. 4, 2008: 495-524.

Dale, Gareth, *Polanyi meditations on economy and society: a review of 'Market Soceity : The Great Transformation Today'*, Dialectic Anthropology, Vol. 34, 2010b, 29-41.

Dale, Gareth, 'Social Democracy, Embeddedness and Decommodification: On the Conceptual Innovations and Intellectual Affiliations of Karl Polanyi', *New Political Economy*, June 2010c.

Dalton, George, 'Economic Anthropology', *American Behavioral Scientist*, Vol. 20 No.5, May/June 1977

Drahokoupil, Jan, 'Re-Inventing Karl Polanyi: On the Contradictory Interpretations of Social Protectionism', *Czech Sociological Review*, Vol. 40 No. 6,2004, hlm. 835-849.

Dugger, William M., 'Instituted Process and Enabling Myth: The Two Faces of the Market', *Journal of Economic Issues*, Vol. XXVIII No. 2, 1993

Duménil, Gérard and Lévy, Dominique, *Capital Resurgence; Roots of the Neoliberal Revolution*, Harvard, 2004

Duncan, Collin M. and David W. Tandy, *From Political Economy to Anthropology*, Black Rose Books, 1994.

Elardo, Justin A. and Al Campbell, "Choice and The Substantivist/Formalist Debate: A Formal Presentation of Three Substantivist Criticisms" dalam *Choice in Economic Contexts: Ethnographic and Theoretical Enquiries*, Vol. 25, 2007.

Fontana, Benedetto, 'Liberty and Domination: Civil society in Gramsci', *Boundary 2*, Duke University Press, 2006

Foster, John Bellamy and Magdoff, Fred, *The Great Financial Crisis: cause and consequence*, Monthly Review Press, 2009

Fourcade, Marion, 'Theories of Market and Theories of Societies', *American Behavioral Scientist*, 2007, Vol.50, No.8, 2007

Gemicci, Kurtuluş, 'Karl Polanyi and The Antinomies of Embeddedness', *Socio-Economic Review*, 2008, hlm. 5-33.

Glasman, Maurice, 'The Great Deformation: Polanyi, Poland, and the Terror of Planned Spontaneity', *New Left Review*, 1994.

Granovetter, Mark, 'Economic Action and Social Structure: The Problem of Embeddedness'" *American Journal of Sociology*, 91 (1985), hlm. 481-510

Granovetter, Mark dan Richard Swedberg (eds.), *The Sociology of Economic Life*, Westview Press, 2001.

Halperin, Sandra, 'Dynamic of Conflict and System Change: the Great Transformation Revisited', *European Journal of International Relations*, 2004 (10).

Halperin, Sandra, *War and Social Change in Modern Europe The Great Transformation Revisited*, Cambridge University Press, 2004.

Hann, Chris and Keith Hart (eds.), *Market and Society: the Great Transformation Today*, Cambridge University Press, UK, 2009.

Hart, Keith, 'Karl Polanyi's Legacy', *Development and Change* 39(6):1135-1143, 2008

Harvey, David, *A Brief History of Neoliberalism*, Oxford University Press, 2005

Harvey, M. , Logan, Ronnie., and Randles, Sally, *Karl Polanyi New Perspective on the place of the economy in society*, Manchester University Press, 2007.

Hayek, Friedrich, *The Road to Serfdom*, The University of Chicago Press, 1972 [1944]

Hector, Michael, 'Karl Polanyi's Social Theory: A Critique', *Politics Society*, Vol.10, 1981

Heiskala, Risto, 'Economy and society: from Parsons through Habermas to semiotic institutionalism', *Theory and Methods*, 2007, Vol.46(2), hlm.243-272.

Hejeebu, Santhi dan Deirdre McCloskey , 'The Reproving of Karl Polanyi', *Critical Review*, 13:3, 285-314

Hirschman, Albert O., 'Rival Interpretations of Market Society: Civilizing, Destructive, or Feeble?', *Journal of Economic Literature*, Vol.20 No.4, 1982, p.1463-1484

Hollingsworth, J. Rogers and Robert Boyer eds., *Contemporary Capitalism The Embeddedness of Institutions*, Cambridge University Press, 1997

Humphreys, S.C., 'History, Economics, and Anthropology: The Work of Karl Polanyi', *History and Theory*, Vol.8, 1969, 165-212.

Jessop, Bob, 'Regulationist and Autopoieticist Reflections on Polanyi's Account of Market Economies and the Market Societies', Department of Sociology, Lancaster University, diunduh dari <http://www.comp.lancs.ac.uk/sociology/papers/Jessop-Regulationist-and-Autopoieticist-Reflections.pdf>

Kindleberger, Charles P., 'The Great Transformation by Karl Polanyi', *Daedalus*, Vol.103 No.1, 1974, pp.45-52

Kosik, Karel, *Dialectics of The Concrete: A Study on Problem of Man and World*, D. Reidel Publishing Company, Boston, 1976.

Krippner, Greta, 'Polanyi Symposium: a Conversation on embeddedness', *Socio-Economic Review*, 2004, hlm. 109-135

Krippner, Greta, 'The Elusive Market: Embeddedness and the paradigm of economic sociology', *Theory and Society*, Vol. 30, 2001, hlm. 775-810.

Krugman, Paul, *The Return of Depressions Economics and the crisis of 2008*, W.W. Norton & Company, 2009

Larragy, Adam, *Reconsidering The Economic Thought of Karl Polanyi in 2009*

Levitt, Kari Polanyi dan Kenneth McRobbie, eds., *Karl Polanyi in Vienna: the Contemporary Significance of The Great Transformation*, Black Rose Books, 2004.

Levitt, Kari Polanyi, ed., *The Life and Work of Karl Polanyi*, Black Rose Books, 1990.

Lie, John, 'Embedding Polanyi's Market Society', *Sociological Perspectives*, Vol.34 No.2, 1991, pp.219-235

Maertens, Eppo, 'Polanyi's Double Movement: A Critical Assessment', *Social Thought & Research*, Vol.29

Muller, Jerry Z., *The Mind and The Market Capitalism in Western Thought*, Anchor Books, 2002

Munck, Ronaldo, *Globalization and Contestation The New Great Counter-movement*, Routledge, New York, 2007

Nigel Thrift, *Knowing Capitalism*, SAGE Publication, 2005

Priyono, B.Herry, 'Adam Smith dan Munculnya Ekonomi: Dari Filsafat Moral ke Ilmu Sosial', *Jurnal Diskursus* Vol.6, No.1, April 2007, hlm. 1-40.

Priyono, B.Herry, 'Homo Oeconomicus', dalam I.Wibowo dan B. Herry-Priyono (eds), *Sesudah Filsafat*, Yogyakarta,Kanisius,2006,hlm.100

Priyono, B.Herry, *Karl Polanyi Menanam Ekonomi*, Orasi Ilmiah disampaikan pada *Colloquium Studi Etika tentang Ekonomi dan Relasi Sosial: Pemikiran Karl Polanyi*, disampaikan pada 28 Oktober 2010 di Unika Atma Jaya, Jakarta

Priyono, B.Herry, *Amartya Sen Membongkar Rasionalitas*, Makalah Wxtension Course Filsafat, Sekolah Tinggi Filsafat Driyarkara Jakarta, 6 Desember 2010, tidak dipublikasikan.

Rain, Sean O., 'Time-space intensification: Karl Polanyi, the double movement, and global informational capitalism', *Theory and Society*, 35, 507-528, 2006

Richter, Rudolf, *New Economic Sociology and New Institutional Economics*, CSNIE, University of Saarland, Germany, 2001

Richter, Rudolf, *New Economic Sociology and New Institutional Economics*, paper to be presented at the Annual Conference of the International Society for New Institutional Economics (ISNIE).

Roemer, E. 'An Anti-Hayekian Manifesto', dalam *New Left Review* edisi I/211

Roth, Guenther, 'The Near-Death of Liberal Capitalism: Perceptions from the Weber to the Polanyi Brothers', *Politics and Society*, Vol. 31, No.2, June 2003, hlm. 263-282

Searle, John R., 'Social Ontology', *Anthropology Theory*, Vol.6 No.1, 2006, pp.12-29

Sen, Amartya, "Rational Fools: A Critique of the Behavioral Foundations of Economic Theory", *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, Vol. 6, No.4, 1977, hlm. 317-344.

Silver, Beverly J. and Giovanni Arrighi, 'Polanyi's "Double Movement": The Belle Epoque of British and U.S. Hegemony Compared', *Politics and Society*, Vol.31, No.2, June 2003, hlm.325-355

Smith, Adam, *The Wealth of Nations* (ed. E. Cannan), New York, Modern Library, 1776 [2000]

Smith, Michael E., 'The Archaeology of Ancient State Economies', *Annual Review Anthropology* Vo.33, 2004, p.73-102

Smoers, Margaret R., 'What's Political or Cultural about Political Culture and the Public Sphere? Toward Historical Sociology of Concept Formation', *Sociological Theory*, Vol.13 No.2, 1995, pp.113-144

Stanfield, J.R. , Michael C. Carroll dan Mary V. Wrenn, "Karl Polanyi on the Limitations of Formalism in Economics", dalam *Choice in Economic Contexts: Ethnographic and Theoretical Enquiries*, Vol. 25, 2007.

Stanfield, James Ronald, *The Economic Thought of Karl Polanyi*, MacMillan, 1986.

Stanfield, J.R., 'The Institutional Economics of Karl Polanyi', *Journal of Economic Issues*, Vol.14 No.3, 1980

Steiner, Phillip, 'Who is right about the modern economy: Polanyi, Zelizer, or both?', *Theory and Society*, Vol.29, June 2007

Stiglitz, Joseph, *Globalization and Its Discontents*, Penguin Books:2002,

Swedberg, Richard, 'New Economic Sociology: What Has Been Accomplished, What is Ahead?', *Acta Sociologica*, Vol.40, 1997

Tönnies, Ferdinand, *Community and Society*, trans. Charles P. Loomis, Michigan University Press, New York, 1957

Vaggi, Gianni and Peter Groenewegen, *A Concise History of Economic Thought from Merchantilism to Monetarism*, Palgrave MacMillan, 2003

Wade, Robert, 'A New Global Financial Architecture', *New Left Review* edisi July-August 2007, him. 113-129

