

**PENOLAKAN WITTGENSTEIN TERHADAP BAHASA PRIVAT
DAN IMPLIKASI EPISTEMOLOGISNYA**

*Tesis untuk memenuhi sebagian persyaratan
mencapai derajat Magister
Program Studi Magister Ilmu Filsafat*

Diajukan oleh

Iwan

00860805 / 20053301010860007

Kepada



**PROGRAM PASCA SARJANA
SEKOLAH TINGGI FILSAFAT DRIYARKARA**

Jakarta, April 2008

TESIS

PENOLAKAN WITTGENSTEIN TERHADAP BAHASA PRIVAT
DAN IMPLIKASI EPISTEMOLOGISNYA

Yang dipersiapkan dan disusun oleh:

Iwan

00860805 / 20053301010860007

Telah dipertahankan di depan Panitia Penguji pada tanggal 5 Maret 2008 dan dinyatakan telah lulus memenuhi syarat

PANITIA UJIAN

Ketua Panitia Ujian/Penguji I


Prof. Dr. J. Sudarminta

Penguji II



Prof. Dr. Franz Magnis-Suseno

Penguji III


Dr. B. Herry-Priyono

Disahkan pada tanggal April 2008

Ketua Program Studi
Magister Ilmu Filsafat


Dr. B. Herry-Priyono

Ketua
Sekolah Tinggi Filsafat Driyarkara


Dr. Eddy Kristiyanto



DAFTAR ISI

Bab I - Pendahuluan	1
1.1. Pengantar.....	1
1.2. Latar Belakang Permasalahan.....	2
1.3. Rumusan Permasalahan.....	3
1.4. Tujuan dan Ruang Lingkup Pembahasan.....	4
1.5. Metode.....	5
1.6. Struktur Tesis.....	5
Bab II - Wittgenstein dan Pandangan Filsafatnya	7
2.1. Tiga Klarifikasi terhadap Filsafat Wittgenstein.....	7
2.2. Sekilas Mengenai Wittgenstein dan Karya-karya Filsafatnya.....	13
2.3. Karakteristik Filsafat Wittgenstein Akhir.....	19
2.4. Relevansi Filsafat Wittgenstein.....	32
Bab III - Latar Belakang Bahasa Privat	38
3.1. Epistemologi Tradisional.....	39
3.2. Dualisme Cartesian.....	50
3.3. Persoalan Epistemologis Cartesianisme.....	53
Bab IV - Penolakan Terhadap Bahasa Privat	63
4.1. Bahasa Privat dan Argumentasi Bahasa Privat.....	65
4.2. Definisi Penunjukan.....	67
4.3. Argumentasi Bahasa Privat.....	73
4.4. Grammar Sensasi-sensasi Internal.....	79
4.5. Implikasi Penolakan terhadap Bahasa Privat.....	91
Bab V - Persoalan Rule-Following dan Aturan 'Privat'	95
5.1. Persoalan Aturan Bahasa.....	96
5.2. Kritik terhadap Platonisme.....	102
5.3. Bahasa dan Bentuk Kehidupan.....	113
5.4. Argumentasi Bahasa Privat dan Aturan 'Privat'.....	116
Bab VI - Dasar-dasar Pengetahuan	122
6.1. Persoalan Keraguan Universal.....	123
6.2. Pengetahuan dan Kepastian.....	126
6.3. Sistem Pengetahuan sebagai "Sungai".....	134

Bab V - Penutup	137
<i>Rangkuman</i>	<i>137</i>
<i>Epilog: Kematian Filsafat?</i>	<i>140</i>
Daftar Pustaka	143



ABSTRAK

[A] Nama: Iwan (00860805 / 20053301010860007)

[B] Judul Tesis: Penolakan Wittgenstein Terhadap Bahasa Privat dan Implikasi Reinterpretasinya

[C] viii + 146 halaman; 2008

[D] Kata-kata kunci: Wittgenstein, *Philosophical Investigations, On Certainty*, Bahasa Privat (*Private Language*), Pengalaman Privat, Mengikuti Aturan (*Rule-Following*), Permainan bahasa, Bentuk Kehidupan (*Form of Life*), Filsafat Bahasa, Epistemologi, Metafisika, *Philosophy of Mind*, Dualisme Cartesian, Tubuh, Pikiran, *Privileged Access*, Sensasi, Fondasionalisme, Behaviorisme, Platonisme, Skeptisisme, Problem Dunia Eksternal, *Problem of other minds*, Pyrrhonisme, Trilema Agrippa, Plato, Descartes, Kripke.

[E] Isi Abstrak: Di tengah keberagaman pembacaan terhadap filsafat Wittgenstein, tesis ini berupaya menafsirkan, mengklarifikasi, serta menjabarkan argumentasi penolakan Wittgenstein terhadap bahasa privat dan menunjukkan implikasi epistemologisnya. Latar belakang penolakan Wittgenstein terhadap bahasa privat adalah epistemologi dan gambaran mental yang dirintis Descartes dan kemudian dilanjutkan serta dikembangkan oleh tradisi filsafat selanjutnya. Dalam tradisi Cartesian, pengetahuan terhadap peristiwa mental diperoleh melalui prinsip '*privileged access*' – dengan demikian, menurut pandangan ini, apa yang terjadi di dalam dunia mental seseorang diketahui secara langsung dan pasti oleh orang tersebut serta tidak bisa diketahui orang lain yang tidak mengalaminya. Pandangan ini melahirkan bencana bagi epistemologi, yakni lahirnya bentuk-bentuk skeptisisme yang argumentasinya sulit dibantah hingga mengakibatkan berbagai upaya untuk mempertahankan pengetahuan selalu jatuh dalam kegelapan. Melalui penolakannya terhadap bahasa privat, Wittgenstein menunjukkan problem tersebut muncul karena filosof tidak memperhatikan bagaimana bahasa bekerja. Problem tersebut dirumuskan melalui bahasa dan menurut Wittgenstein pada bahasa yang kita gunakan lah persoalan tersebut harusnya dikembalikan. Ketika bahasa yang kita gunakan telah diklarifikasi, maka problem-problem dalam filsafat akan hilang dengan sendirinya.

[F] Daftar Pustaka: 104 buku & artikel (1922-2007)

[G] Dosen Pembimbing: Prof. Dr. J. Sudarminta

Bab V - Penutup.....	137
<i>Rangkuman</i>	<i>137</i>
<i>Epilog: Kematian Filsafat?.....</i>	<i>140</i>
Daftar Pustaka	143



Daftar Pustaka

1. Pustaka Primer : Karya Wittgenstein (berdasarkan kronologis)

- NB : Notebooks 1914-16, 1961 (1979), G.E.M. Anscombe dan G.H. von Wright (ed.), G.E.M. Anscombe (a.b.), Oxford: Basil Blackwell
- TLP : *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, 1961, D.F. Pears and B.F. McGuinness (a.b.), New York: Humanities Press.
- PR : *Philosophical Remarks*, 1964, R. Rhees (ed.), R. Hargreaves dan R. White (a.b.), Oxford: Blackwell
- PG : *Philosophical Grammar*, 1974, R. Rhees (ed.), A. Kenny (a.b.), Oxford: Blackwell.
- BB : *The Blue and Brown Books*, 1958, Oxford: Blackwell
- NFL : Wittgenstein's Notes for Lectures on "Private Experience" and "Sense Data", ed. Rush Rhees, *Philosophical Review*, LXXVII, no. 3 (1968), hal. 275-320
- PI : *Philosophical Investigations*, 1953, G.E.M. Anscombe and R. Rhees (ed.), G.E.M. Anscombe (a.b.), Oxford: Blackwell
- RFM : *Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*, 1967, ed. R. Rhees, G. H. von Wright dan G. E. M. Anscombe, Oxford: Blackwell
- Z : *Zettel*, 1967, G.E.M. Anscombe dan G.H. von Wright (ed.), G.E.M. Anscombe (a.b.), Oxford: Blackwell
- OC : *On Certainty*, 1969, G.E.M. Anscombe dan G.H. von Wright (ed.), G.E.M. Anscombe and D. Paul (a.b.), Oxford: Blackwell.

2. Pustaka Sekunder

- Anscombe, G.E.M, 1981, *From Parmenides to Wittgenstein*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell
- , 1981, *Metaphysics and the Philosophy of Mind*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell
- , 1985, "Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language", *Ethics*, Vol.95 (1985), h. 342-352
- Avramides, Anita, 2001, *Other Minds*, London: Routledge
- Appiah, Kwame A., 2003, *Thinking it Through*, New York: Oxford University Press
- Biltzki, A. & Matar, A. (ed.), 1988, *The Story of Analytic Philosophy*, New York: Routledge
- Blackburn, Simon, 1984, *Spreading the Word: Groundings in the Philosophy of Language*, Oxford: Oxford University Press
- , 1993, *Essays in Quasi-realism*, New York: Oxford University Press
- Bloor, David, 1997, *Wittgenstein, Rules and Institutions*, London: Routledge
- Boghossian, P.A., 1989, "The Rule-following Considerations", *Mind* Vol. 98 (1989), hal. 507-49
- Broughton, Janet, 2002, *Descartes's Method of Doubt*, Princeton: Princeton University Press
- Brown, James R., 1999, *Philosophy of Mathematics: An Introduction to a World of Proofs and Pictures*, London: Routledge
- Budd, Malcolm, 1986, "Wittgenstein on Sensuous Experiences", *The Philosophical Quarterly*, Vol. 36 (1986), hal. 174-195

- Canfield, John V., "Criteria and Rules of Language", *The Philosophical Review*, Vol. 83, No. 1 (1974), hal 70-87
- , "The Community View", *The Philosophical Review*, Vol. 105, No. 4 (1996), hal 469-488
- Carruthers, Peter, 1986(2001), *Introducing Persons*, London: Routledge
- Cavell, Stanley, 1979, *The Claim of Reason : Wittgenstein, Skepticism, Morality, and Tragedy*, New York : Oxford University Press
- Chalmers, David. J., 1996, *The Conscious Mind: In Search of a Fundamental Theory*, New York: Oxford University Press
- Chirara, Charles S. & Fodor, Jerry, 1965, "Operationalism and Ordinary Language: A Critique of Wittgenstein", *American Philosophical Quarterly*, Vol. 2 (1965), hal 281-295
- Cook, John W., 1966, "Wittgenstein on Privacy" dalam Pitcher, George (ed.), 1966
- , 1972, "Solipsism and Language" dalam Ambrose, A. & Lazerowitz, M. (ed.), *Ludwig Wittgenstein: Philosophy and Language*, London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd
- Curley, Edwin, 1978, *Descartes Against the Skeptics*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press
- Descartes, René, 1639(1998), *Meditations on First Philosophy*, dalam Cottingham, J./Stoothoff, R./Murdoch, D. (ed.), 1998, *Descartes: Selected Philosophical Writing*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Diamond, Cora, 1991, *Realism and the Realistic Spirit*, Cambridge, MA: The M.I.T. Press
- Dicker, Georges, 1993, *Descartes: An Analytical and Historical Introduction*, Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Fann, K. T. (ed.), 1967, *Ludwig Wittgenstein: The Man and His Philosophy*, New Jersey : Humanities Press
- Finch, H.L., 1995, *Wittgenstein*, Boston: Element
- Fine, Gail., 2000, "Descartes and Ancient Skepticism: Reheated Cabbage?", *The Philosophical Review*, Vol 109 (2000), hal 195-234
- Fogelin, Robert J, 1976, *Wittgenstein*, London: Routledge & Kegan Paul
- Frege, G., 1984, "Thoughts", dalam McGuinness, B. (ed.), *Collected Papers on Mathematics, Logic, and Philosophy*, (ed.), New York: Blackwell
- Garver, Newton., 1994, *This Complicated Form of Life*, Illinois: Open Court
- Gellner, Ernest, 1959 (1979), *Word and Things*, London: Routledge
- , 1998, *Language and Solitude: Wittgenstein, Malinowski and the Habsburg Dilemma*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Hacker, P.M.S., 1990, *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Mind, Volume 3 of an Analytical Commentary on the Philosophical Investigations*, Oxford: Blackwell
- , 1996, *Wittgenstein's Place in Twentieth Century Analytic Philosophy*, Oxford: Blackwell
- , 1997, *Insight and Illusion: Themes in the Philosophy of Wittgenstein*, Bristol: Thoemmes Press
- , 1999, *Wittgenstein*, New York: Routledge
- Hankinson, R. J. , 1995, *The Sceptics*, London: Routledge
- Jones, OR. (ed.), 1971, *The Private Language Argument*, London: Macmillan and Co.
- Kenny, Anthony, 1973 (2006), *Wittgenstein*, Revised Edition, Oxford: Blackwell
- , 1966, "Cartesian Privacy", dalam Pitcher, George (ed.), 1966, *Wittgenstein: The Philosophical Investigations, Modern Studies in Philosophy: A Collection of Critical Essay*, London: Macmillan

- , 1971, "Verification Principle and the Private Language Argument", dalam Jones, OR. (ed.), *The Private Language Argument*, London: Macmillan and Co.
- , 1985, *The Legacy of Wittgenstein*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell
- , 2006, *An Illustrated Brief History of Western Philosophy*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell
- , 2007, *Philosophy in the Modern World: A New History of Western Philosophy, Volume 4*, New York: Oxford University Press
- Kirk, Robert, 1999, *Relativism and Reality: A Contemporary Introduction*, London: Routledge
- Kripke, Saul, 1982, *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language*, Oxford: Blackwell
- Locke, John, 1894, *Essay Concerning Human Understanding*, AC Frase (ed.), Oxford, Oxford University Press
- Luntley, Michael, 2003, *Wittgenstein: Meaning and Judgment*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishing
- Magee, Brian, 1973, *Modern British Philosophy*, Herts: Paladin
- Malcolm, Norman, 1958, "Knowledge of Other Minds", *The Journal of Philosophy*, Vol. 55 (1958), hal. 969-978
- , 1963, "Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations", dalam Pitcher, George (ed.), 1966,
- , 1971, *Problem of Mind: Descartes to Wittgenstein*, New York: Harper Torchbook
- , 1984, *Ludwig Wittgenstein: A Memoir*, Oxford: Oxford University Press
- , 1986, *Nothing is Hidden: Wittgenstein's Criticism of his Early Thought*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell
- McGinn, Colin, 1984, *Wittgenstein on Meaning*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell
- , 1997, *Minds & Bodies: Philosophers and Their Ideas*, New York: Oxford University Press
- , 2002, *The Making of a Philosopher*, New York: HarperCollins
- Monk, Ray, 1990, *Ludwig Wittgenstein: The Duty of Genius*, New York: Penguin Books
- Pears, David, 1971, *Wittgenstein*, London: Fontana/Collins
- , 1987, *The False Prison: A Study of the Development of Wittgenstein's Philosophy* (Volume 1), Oxford: Clarendon Press
- , 1988, *The False Prison: A Study of the Development of Wittgenstein's Philosophy* (Volume 2), Oxford: Clarendon Press
- Pitcher, George (ed.), 1966, *Wittgenstein: The Philosophical Investigations, Modern Studies in Philosophy: A Collection of Critical Essay*, London: Macmillan
- Popkin, Richard. H., 1964, *The History of Scepticism From Erasmus To Descartes*, New York: Harper Torchbooks
- Pritchard, Duncan, *Wittgenstein on Scepticism*,
[<http://www.philosophy.ed.ac.uk/staff/documents/WittOnScepticism.pdf>], diakses pada 25 November 2007
- Putnam, Hilary, 1975 (1981) *Reason Truth and History*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- , 1995, *Pragmatism - an Open Question*, Massachusetts: Blackwell
- Pyle, Andrew (ed.), 1999, *Key Philosophers in Conversation*, London: Routledge
- Rorty, Richard, 1973, *Criteria and Necessity, Nous*, Vol. 7 (1973), hal. 313-329
- , 1979, *Philosophy and the Mirror of Nature*, New Jersey: Princeton University Press

- , 1989, *Contingency Irony and Solidarity*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- , 1991, *Objectivity, Relativism, and Truth: Philosophical Papers Volume 1*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Russell, Bertrand, 1959, *My Philosophical Development*, London: George Allen and Unwin
- , 1967, "Memoirs of Wittgenstein", dalam Fann, K.T.(ed.), 1967, *Ludwig Wittgenstein: The Man and His Philosophy*, New Jersey : Humanities Press
- Searle, John. R., 2002, *Consciousness and Language*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- , 2004, *Mind: A Brief Introduction*, New York: Oxford University Press
- Shanker, S.G., 1984, "Sceptical Confusions About Rule-following", *Mind*, New Series, Vol. 93, No. 371 (1984), hal. 423-429
- Sluga, Hans. & Stern, David. G. (ed) 1996) *The Cambridge Companion to Wittgenstein*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Smith, Peter, 1975, "Solitary Speakers", *Mind*, New Series, Vol. 84, No. 336 (1975), hal. 590-594
- Smith, Peter. & Jones, O.R., 1986, *The Philosophy of Mind*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Soames, Scott, 2003, *Philosophical Analysis in The Twentieth Century, Volume 2: The Age of Meaning*, New Jersey : Princeton University Press
- Stern, David, 1995, *Wittgenstein on Mind and Language*, New York: Oxford University Press
- Stroud, Barry, 1965, "Wittgenstein and Logical Necessity", *The Philosophical Review*, Vol. 74 (1965), hal. 504-18
- Sudarminta, J., 2002, *Epistemologi Dasar: Pengantar Filsafat Pengetahuan*, Yogyakarta: Kanisius
- Sugiharto, Bambang I., 1996, *Posmodernisme: Tantangan bagi Filsafat*, Yogyakarta: Kanisius
- Suter, Ronald, 1989, *Interpreting Wittgenstein: A Cloud of Philosophy, a Drop of Grammar*, Philadelphia: Temple University Press
- Thomson, J.J., 1971. "The Verification Principle and the private language argument", *American Philosophical Quarterly*, Vol. 1 (1964), hal. 20-31
- Williams, Bernard, 1978, *Descartes: The Project of Pure Enquiry*, New York: Penguin Books.
- Wilson, M.D., 1978, *Descartes*, London: Routledge & Kegan Paul
- Wright, Crispin, 1981, "Rule-following, Objectivity and the Theory of Meaning" dalam C. Leich dan S. Holtzman, (ed.), *Wittgenstein: To Follow a Rule*, London: Routledge, hal. 99-117
- , 1984, "Kripke's Account of the Argument Against Private Language", *The Journal of Philosophy*, Vol. 81, No. 12. (1984), hal. 759-778
- , 1989, "Wittgenstein's Later Philosophy of Mind: Sensation, Privacy, and Intention", *The Journal of Philosophy*, Vol. 86, No. 11 (1989), hal. 622-634
- , Scepticism, Certainty, Moore, and Wittgenstein, [http://www.st-andrews.ac.uk/~arche/old/pages/papers/Weiss_Kolbel.pdf], diakses pada 25 November 2007
- Wright, G.H. von, 1982, *Wittgenstein*, Oxford: Basil Blackwell