

**IMIGRASI DAN KEWARGANEGARAAN:
SUATU STUDI TENTANG KOSMOPOLITANISME
SEYLA BENHABIB**

**Tesis untuk memenuhi sebagian persyaratan
mencapai derajat Magister
Program Studi Magister Ilmu Filsafat**



**diajukan oleh
Amin Mudzakkir
01920811**

Kepada

**PROGRAM PASCA SARJANA
SEKOLAH TINGGI FILSAFAT DRIYARKARA**

Jakarta, Juni 2015




TESIS
IMIGRASI DAN KEWARGANEGARAAN:
SUATU STUDI TENTANG KOSMOPOLITANISME
SEYLA BENHABIB

yang dipersiapkan dan disusun oleh

Amin Mudzakkir

01920811

telah dipertahankan di depan Panitia Penguji pada tanggal
6 Mei 2015 dan dinyatakan telah lulus memenuhi syarat

PANITIA UJIAN	
Ketua Panitia Ujian / Penguji I  Dr. B. Herry-Priyono	
Penguji II  Dr. Karlina Supelli	Penguji III  Dr. Al. Andang L. Binawan

Disahkan pada tanggal 30 Juni 2015

Ketua Program Studi Magister Filsafat  Dr. B. Herry-Priyono	 Ketua Sekolah Tinggi Filsafat Driyarkara  Simon Petrus L. Tjahjadi
--	--

Daftar Isi

Halaman Judul	i
Halaman Pengesahan	ii
Halaman Pernyataan	iii
Daftar Isi	iv
Halaman Abstrak	vii
Bab I	
Pendahuluan	1
1. Latar Belakang	1
2. Permasalahan	6
3. Sistematika	11
Bab II	
Teori Kritis	13
1. Pendahuluan	13
2. Mazhab Frankfurt	14
3. Teori Diskursus Habermas	18
4. Kritik Benhabib	24
5. Utopia Komunikatif	27
7. Rangkuman	31
Bab III	
Universalisme Interaktif	33
1. Pendahuluan	33
2. Masalah Netralitas	34
3. Ruang Publik dan Privat	38
4. Tantangan Skeptisisme	45
5. Rangkuman	51
Bab IV	
Klaim-Klaim Kebudayaan	53
1. Pendahuluan	53
2. Dimensi Normatif Kebudayaan	56
3. Politik Kebudayaan yang Kompleks	61
4. Multikulturalisme dan Perempuan	67
5. Rangkuman	71
Bab V	
Keanggotaan Politik	72
1. Pendahuluan	72
2. Dilema Konstitutif Demokrasi Liberal	74
3. Keramahmataman	77
4. Hak untuk Mendapatkan Hak	83
5. Keadilan Distributif Global	87
6. Tantangan Komunitarian	90
7. Rangkuman	94

Bab VI	Penutup	95
	1. Rangkuman umum	95
	2. Relevansi	100
	3. Prospek	104
Daftar Pustaka		106



ABSTRAK

[A] **Nama:** Amin Mudzakkir (01920811)

[B] **Judul Tesis:** Imigrasi dan Kewarganegaraan: Suatu Studi tentang Kosmopolitanisme Seyla Benhabib

[C] vii + 111 halaman; 2015

[D] **Kata-kata kunci:** imigrasi, kewarganegaraan, kosmopolitanisme, Teori Kritis, etika diskursus, universalisme interaktif, yang lain umum, yang lain khusus, skeptisisme, keanggotaan politik.

[E] **Isi Abstrak:** Tujuan studi ini adalah mengkaji apa yang bisa disuarakan oleh filsafat moral dan politik di hadapan persoalan yang menghadang para pengungsi, pencari suaka, dan imigran tidak terdokumentasi lainnya. Berbasis pada pemikiran kosmopolitanisme Seyla Benhabib yang berusaha meradikalisasi etika diskursus, studi ini berargumen bahwa kritik Benhabib terhadap Habermas memang berhasil meradikalisasi ruang lingkup diskursus dari subjek moral dan politik yang umum ke subjek moral dan politik yang kongkret. Dengan ini terbuka peluang lebih lebar bagi para pengungsi, pencari suaka, dan imigran yang tidak terdokumentasi, termasuk juga perempuan, untuk terlibat secara aktif dalam diskursus imigrasi dan kewarganegaraan. Dengan ini pula suatu model kosmopolitanisme yang berbasis pada 'universalisme interaktif' memperoleh justifikasinya yang legitim. Akan tetapi, radikalisisasi yang dilakukan oleh Benhabib dengan mengawinkan etika diskursus dan wawasan Hegelian serta Aristotelian itu mempunyai keterbatasan, sebab pada dasarnya ia masih tetap bekerja di wilayah formal dan prosedural. Dengan kata lain, Benhabib belum beranjak jauh dari Habermas, sehingga problematik yang lahir dari pemikirannya sampai batas tertentu bisa kita lihat sebagai problematik yang juga dialamatkan kepada Habermas.

[F] **Daftar Pustaka:** 89 (1977-2015)

[G] **Dosen Pembimbing:** Dr. B. Herry-Priyono

Daftar Pustaka

Kepustakaan Primer

- Benhabib, Seyla. 1977. *Natural Rights and Hegel: An Essay in Modern Political Philosophy*, tesis Ph.D, Universitas Yale.
- , 1984. "Epistemologies of Postmodernism: A Rejoinder to Jean-François Lyotard", *New German Critique*, No. 33 (Autumn).
- , 1986. *Critique, Norm, and Utopia: A Study of the Foundation of Critical Theory*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- , 1992. *Situating the Self: Gender, Community, and Postmodernism in Contemporary Ethics*. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- , 1995. "Feminism and Postmodernism: An Uneasy Alliance", dalam Seyla Benhabib, et. all., *Feminist Contentions: A Philosophical Exchange*. London/New York: Routledge.
- , dan Drucilla Cornell. 1996. "Introduction: Beyond the Politics of Gender" dalam Seyla Benhabib dan Drucilla Cornell, *Feminism as Critique* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. Cetakan keempat.
- , 2002. *The Claims of Culture*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- , 2003. *The Reluctant Modernism of Hannah Arendt*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- , 2004. *The Rights to Others: Aliens, Residents, and Citizens*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- (ed). 2010. *Politics in Dark Times: Encounters with Hannah Arendt*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- , 2011. *Dignity in Adversity: Human Rights in Troubled Times* (Cambridge: Polity
- , "The Iraq war and the conflict of interpretations"
<http://w2.bcn.cat/bcnmetropolis/arxiu/en/pagebda4.html?id=21&ui=73> (diakses 17 Oktober 2013)
- , "Critique of humanitarian reason", <http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2014-07-18-benhabib-en.html> (diakses 29 Maret 2015)

Kepustakaan Sekunder

- Beck, Ulrich. 2001. "The Cosmopolitan State: Towards a Realistic Utopia", <http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2001-12-05-beck-en.html>
- Bell, Daniel, "Communitarianism", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2013 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2013/entries/communitarianism/>
- Beitz, Charles. 1999. *Political Theory and International Relations*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Brock, Gillian dan Harry Brighouse (ed.). 2005. *The Political Philosophy of Cosmopolitanism*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brock, Gillian. 2009. *Global Justice: A Cosmopolitan Account*. New York: Oxford University
- Bracci, Sharon L. 2002. "Seyla Benhabib's Interactive Universalism: Fragile Hope for a Radically Democratic Conversational Model", *Qualitative Inquiry*, Volume 8 Number 4.
- Brettell, Caroline B. dan James F. Hollifield. 2000. "Introduction" dalam Caroline B. Brettell dan James F. Hollifield (ed.) *Migration Theory: Talking across Disciplines*. New York/London: Routledge.
- Calhoun, Craig. 2007. *Nations Matter: Culture, History and Cosmopolitan Dream*. London: Routledge.
- Caren, Josep H. 1995. "Immigration, Welfare, and Justice" dalam Warren F. Schwartz, *Justice in Immigration*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Cohen, Joshua, Matthew Howard, and Martha Nussbaum (eds.). 1999. *Is Multiculturalism Bad for Women: Susan Moller Okin with Respondent*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Delanty, Gerard. 2009. *The Cosmopolitan Imagination: The Renewal of Critical Social Theory* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Farabi, Nadia. 2014. *Hambatan Pemulangan Pengungsi Internal Syiah Sampang dan Ahmadiyah Lombok*, Tesis S-2, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Yogyakarta.
- Finlayson, James Gordon. 2005. *Habermas: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Flax, Jane. 1990. *Thinking Fragments: Psychoanalysis, Feminism, and Postmodernism in the Contemporary West*. Berkeley/Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Fraser, Nancy. 2004. "Social Justice in the Age of Identity Politics: Redistribution, Recognition, and participation", dalam Nancy Fraser dan Axel Honneth, *Redistribution or Recognition?: A Political-Philosophical Exchange*. London: Verso.
- Fraser, Nancy. 2013. *Fortunes of Feminism: Froms State-Managed Capitalism to Neoliberal Crisis*. London/New York: Verso.
- Freeman, Samuel. 2012. "Original Position", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Spring Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), <<http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2012/entries/original-position> (diakses pada 19 Nopember 2013).
- Fukuyama, Francis. 1992. *The End of History and the Last Man*. New York: The Free Press, 1992.
- http://www.princeton.edu/~achaney/tmve/wiki100k/docs/Naturalistic_fallacy.html
- http://www.economist.com/news/middle-east-and-africa/21632640-statelessness-punishment-against-political-dissent-gulf-new-unpeople?fsrc=email_to_a_friend (diakses 29 Maret 2015).
- <http://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2013/10/syrian-refugees-face-an-increasingly-horrific-situation-in-turkey/280207/> (diakses 29 Maret 2015).
- <http://www.unhcr.org/5461e5ec3c.html> (diakses 29 Maret 2015).
- <http://www.un.org/en/documents/udhr/index.shtml#a13> (diakses 16 Maret 2013).
- Habermas, Jurgen. 1998. *The Inclusion of Other: Studies in Political Theory*. Cambridge: The MIT Press.
- , 2001. *The Postnational Constellation: Political Essays*. Cambridge: The MIT Press.
- Hardiman, F. Budi. 1990. *Kritik Ideologi: Pertautan Pengetahuan dan Kepentingan*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- , 1993. *Menuju Masyarakat Komunikatif: Ilmu, Masyarakat, Politik, dan Postmodernisme menurut Jurgen Habermas*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- , 2009. *Demokrasi Deliberatif: Menimbang 'Negara Hukum' dan 'Ruang Publik' dalam Teori Diskursus Jurgen Habermas*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.

- , 2010. "Komersialisasi Ruang Publik menurut Hannah Arendt dan Jurgen Habermas", dalam F. Budi Hardiman (ed.), *Ruang Publik: Melacak "Partisipasi Demokratis" dari Polis sampai Cyberspace*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- Hefner, Robert W. 2007. "Multikulturalisme dan Kewarganegaraan di Malaysia, Singapura, dan Indonesia" dalam Robert W. Hefner (ed.), *Politik Multikulturalisme: Menggugat Realitas Kebangsaan*, terj. Bernardus Hidayat. Yogyakarta: Impulse-Kanisius.
- Herry-Priyono, B. 2002. *Anthony Giddens: Suatu Pengantar*. Jakarta: KPG.
- Hepburn, Elizabeth R. 1997. "The Situated but Directionless Self: The Postmetaphysical World of Benhabib's Discourse Ethics", *Journal of Applied Philosophy*, Vol.14, No. 1.
- Harvey, David. 2000. *The Condition of Postmodernity: An Enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- , 2009. *Cosmopolitanism and the Geographies of Freedom*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Hill David, T dan Anna Dragojlovic. 2010. "Indonesian exiles: crossing cultural, political and religious borders", *Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs*, Vol. 44, No. 1.
- Hudson, Wayne. 1982. *The Marxist Philosophy of Ernst Bloch*. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Ismayawati, Isya. 2013. *Manusia Perahu: Tragedi Kemanusiaan di Pulau Galang*. Jakarta: Penerbit Kompas.
- Jurist, Elliot L., 1989. "Critique, Norm and Utopia: A Study of the Foundations of Critical Theory by Seyla Benhabib-Review", *The Journal of Philosophy*, Vol. 86, No. 4, Apr.
- Jay, Martin. 1973. *The Dialectical Imagination: A History of the Frankfurt School and the Institute of Social Research, 1923-1950*. London: Heineman.
- Kant, Immanuel. 2005. *Menuju Perdamaian Abadi: Sebuah Konsep Filosofis*, terj. Arpani Harun dan Hendaro Setiadi. Bandung/Jakarta: Mizan/Goethe-Institut.
- Koser, Khalid. 2007. *International Migration: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Kastoryano, Riva. 2006. "French Secularism and Islam: France's Headscarf Affair" dalam Tariq Modood, Anna Triandafyllidou, dan Ricard Zapata-Barrero, *Multiculturalism, Muslim, and Citizenship: A European Approach*. London/New York: Routledge.

- Lenz, Gunter H. dan Antje Dallman, "Introduction" dalam Kwame Anthony Appiah, et. all. *Justice, Governance, Cosmopolitanism, and the Politics of Difference: Reconfiguration in a Transnational World*. Berlin: Humbolt-Universitat zu Berlin.
- Lyotard, Jean-Francois. 1994. *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Magnis-Suseno, Franz. 1992. *Filsafat sebagai Ilmu Kritis*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- . 2000. *12 Tokoh Etika Abad ke-20*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius, 2000.
- . 2006. *Etika Abad Kedua Puluh: 12 Teks Kunci*. Yogyakarta, Kanisius, 2006.
- . 2009. *Menjadi Manusia: Belajar dari Aristoteles*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- McNay, Lois. 2008. *Against Recognition*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2008.
- Messina, Anthony M. 2002. "Conclusion" dalam Anthony M. Messina (ed.), *West European Immigration and Immigrant Policy in New Century*. New York: Praeger, 2002.
- Miller, Matthew. "Kant, Hegel, and Habermas: Does Hegel's Critique of Kant Apply to Discourse Ethics?", *Auslegung*, Vol. 25, No. 1.
- Mouffe, Chantal. 2000. *The Democratic Paradox*. London/New York: Verso.
- Mudzakkir, Amin (ed.). 2004. *The Mobility of Unskilled and Undocumented Migrants: Indonesian Workers in the Netherlands*. Jakarta: LIPI Press.
- Modood, Tariq dan Rita Kastoryano. 2006. "Secularism and Accomodation of Muslims in Europe" dalam Tariq Modood, Richard Zapata-Barrero, dan Anna Triandafyllidou (Ed.). *Multiculturalism, Muslims, and Citizenship: A European Approac*. London: Routledge.
- Naseem, M Ayaz dan Emery J. Hyslop. 2006. "Nussbaum's Concept of Cosmopolitanism: Practical Possibility or Academic Delusion?". *Paideusis*, Volume 15, No. 2.
- Ong, Aihwa. 1999. *Flexible Citizenship: The Cultural Logic of Transnationality*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1999.
- Oostinde, Geert. 2010. *Postcolonial Netherlands: Sixty-Five Years of Forgetting, Commemorating, Silencing*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Osborn, Ronald. "Seyla Benhabib, Wendell Berry, and the Question of Migrant and Refugee Rystad, Goran. 1992. "Immigration History and the Future of International Migration", *International Migration Rejw*, Vol. 26, No. 4 (Winter).

- Pogge, Thomas. 1989. *Realizing Rawls*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press
- Parekh, Bhikhu. 2008. *Rethinking Multiculturalism: Keberagaman Budaya dan Teori Politik*, edisi terjemahan. Yogyakarta: Impulse-Kanisius.
- Pensky, Max. "Editor's Introduction". 2001. Jurgen Habermas, *The Postnational Constellation*. Cambridge: The MITP Press.
- Pop, Valentina. "Economic crisis fuelling racism in Europe, report warns", <https://euobserver.com/social/30149> (diakses 29 Maret 2015).
- Sacher, Ayelet. 2004. *Multicultural Jurisdiction: Cultural Differences and Women's Rights*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Schmitt, Carl. 2000. *The Crisis of Parliamentary Democracy*. Cambridge: The MIT Press. cetakan keenam.
- Sutherland, Liz. 2010. "The Divergent Cosmopolitanisms of Hannah Arendt", <http://www.cpsa-acsp.ca/papers-2010/Sutherland.pdf> (diakses 7 Nopember 2013).
- Soysal, Yasemin. *Limits of Citizenship: Migrants and Postcolonial Membership in Europe*.
- Toniolatti, Eduardo. 2009. "Complex Identities: Seyla Benhabib between Feminism and Discourse Ethic", *Philosophy Today* (Spring).
- Thomsen, Kyle. 2011. Giving Voice to the Vulnerable: Discourse Ethics and Amnesty for Undocumented Immigration", tesis Ph.D, Loyola University Chicago.
- Unat, F. Oya. 2005. *Jurgen Habermas's Critical Theoretical Cosmopolitanism*, tesis Ph.D, The New School for Social Research, New York.
- van Hooff, Stan dan Wim Vandekerckhove (ed.). 2010. *Questioning Cosmopolitanism*. Springer.
- Volk, Chritian. 2010. "The Decline of Order: Hannah Arendt and the Paradoxes of the Nation-State" dalam Benhabib *Politics in Dark Times: Encounters with Hannah Arendt*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- White, Robert, "Herder: On the Ethics of Nationalism", *Humanitas*, Volume XVIII, Nos. 1 and 2.
- Whittaker, David J. 2006. *Asylum Seekers and Refugees in the Contemporary World*. London/New York: Routledge.
- Young, Iris Marion. 1988. "Critique, Norm, and Utopia: A Study of the Foundations of Critical Theory by Seyla Benhabib-Review", *Ethics*, Vol. 98, No. 2, Jan.